

UDC 331

**THE EFFECTIVENESS OF EMPLOYEE SUPERVISION IMPLEMENTATION UTILIZING  
CLOSED CIRCUIT TELEVISION MEDIA AS A DISCIPLINE MECHANISM: A STUDY  
ON VOSCO COFFEE MALANG, INDONESIA**

**Geaviano Kevin Adri, Musadieg M. Al, Aziz Aulia Luqman\***  
Faculty of Administrative Science, University of Brawijaya, Indonesia  
\*E-mail: [aualialuqmanaziz@ub.ac.id](mailto:aualialuqmanaziz@ub.ac.id)

**ABSTRACT**

Supervision is expected to increase work effectiveness, as it is the control point of all the activities carried out by the company successfully. It exhibited that companies are able to make the best use of existing wealth such as employees and material resources. Leaders are obliged to supervise employees in preventive and constructive manner. The leaders would obtain information on each aspect in activities and problem in the organizational unit environment task implementation. Should there are deviations, leaders are capable to immediately take corrective steps and actions as needed in accordance with the predetermined plan and applicable regulations. CCTV is an evidence that can be trusted truthfully when certain problems are found, therefore it is capable to shorten the supervision time manually. It can be evaluated by playing back records when required (Cahyadi, 2014). In this case, the supervision carried out by the VOSCO Coffee cafe is streamlined and effective. It is capable to monitor employee performance in every field because it is monitored directly by the owner. As for one of the technical forms, CCTV camera directly monitors the activities in every division such as Kitchen Helper, Waitress, Head Kitchen, etc. for 24 hours.

**KEY WORDS**

Employee, supervision, CCTV, discipline.

Due to current world development, a café does not merely function as a place to eat and drink. It can be utilized to perform various important activities such as business meetings, parties, workshops, movie/soccer night, or meeting close relatives. A huge amount of cafes have developed their functions, as these establishments provide a place for these activities. Kasali, a marketing expert, stated that "Coffee is no longer used to merely eliminate sleepiness. It is a part of a lifestyle, where the coffee shop is a very popular hangout" (2008). Adding the functionality of the cafe itself is an innovation from the cafe manager to attract consumers. In addition to marketing their products, a cafe also strives to further improve its core or human resources to be ready to compete with other cafes.

The role of human resources is one of the most important factors in an organization. The organization is the community activity in an effort to achieve goals. An organization acts a whole instead of available sources, both human and non-human sources, as well as the task group, authorities, and responsibilities in such a way as to create an organization that can be mobilized as a predetermined unit. Musanef, (2002) Personnel Management in Indonesia, Gunung Agung, Jakarta. Each person or employee must possess clarity about their respective duties, authorities, and responsibilities. Effective use of human resources is a method for an organization to maintain survival and growth in the future. In other words, the success or decline of an organization depends on the expertise and skills of each employee.

In order to improve individual employee work success, leaders must take a step in management managing their work. Workers, laborers, employees, human potential as an activator of the organization in realizing its existence or potential is an asset. It functions as non-material capital in business organizations. It can be formed into real potential physically and non-physically in realizing the existence of the organization (Nawawi, 2011).

Supervision becomes the most important element in fostering individuals in the organization as supervision is the employee driving force to be able to act according to plan

and applicable rules. This is in accordance with the statement of Stoner, et al (2000), supervision in management is a systematic effort in setting performance standards of various planned goals, designing a feedback information system, comparing the performance achieved with predetermined standards, determining whether deviations and the level of significance of each of these deviations, and take the necessary actions to ensure that all of the company's power is used effectively and efficiently in achieving the company's objectives.

Supervision is expected to increase work effectiveness, as effectiveness is the control point of all the activities carried out by the company successfully. Supervision can be defined as a process to ensure that organizational and management goals can be achieved. This is related to methods in conducting predetermined activities. This understanding exhibited that there is a very close relationship between planning and supervision. It exhibited that companies are able to make the best use of existing wealth such as employees and material resources. Leaders are obliged to supervise employees in preventive and constructive manner. The leaders would obtain information on each aspect in activities and problem in the organizational unit environment task implementation. Should there are deviations, leaders are capable to immediately take corrective steps and actions as needed in accordance with the predetermined plan and applicable regulations. In order for the supervision of activities and employee performance must be adjusted to

The implementation of an organization without any supervision may decrease work discipline and will have a direct effect and may hinder organization activities. Therefore, an effective monitoring system is required to produce a positive impact on an organization's development. In this case, information technology may aid organizations to improve the supervision system.

Technological developments are rapidly increasing in line with the process of globalization. According to Surjono (2011), Closed circuit television (CCTV) is a recording device that uses one or more video cameras, producing video or audio data. Its existence would further facilitate and solve various problems occurring in various fields. CCTV camera technology could be used to solve various problems. CCTV is an evidence that can be trusted when certain problems are found, therefore it can shorten the supervision time manually and can be evaluated by playing back records when required (Cahyadi, 2014). It is also considered prospective when applied in an effort to improve employee discipline.

There are various Coffee Shops in Malang City. Nevertheless, there is a Coffee Shop that is different from the others, namely Cafe VOSCO Coffee Malang. Cafe VOSCO Coffee Malang has implemented CCTV as a tool for monitoring employees and security in the premise. In contrast to other cafes, which merely applies CCTV as a security surveillance device.

Based on researchers' observations and the results of interviews with VOSCO Coffee Malang cafe manager on April 1, 2018, supervision on employees is still less effective and efficient. When the supervisor is not in the premise, they cannot directly supervise the employees. Some employees lack discipline during work hours. They arrive late and or not completing work according to a predetermined time standard. This was explained when researchers visited the VOSCO Coffee Malang Cafe and watched CCTV footage. There were many employees who arrived late and conducted improper activities during working hours, for example using cell phones and not on standby whether there is a customer or not. These disciplinary problems greatly affect work performance.

CCTV in the VOSCO Coffee Malang Cafe is used to monitor employee performance. This was conducted as the use of human power alone to monitor the Cafe is not adequate to monitor the whole premise. Through CCTV, employee behavior is observed starting from the arrival of employees, activities during work hour, up to after hours. Therefore, the application of discipline to employees will be able to foster employee satisfaction in working. This is in accordance with the statement from Budi & Waridin (2006), stating that discipline is an ideal condition supporting the duties implementation that adheres to the rules to support work optimization.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

*Employee Supervision.* Supervision is a function of management to ensure that work is carried out in accordance with the standards set out in the plan. "Supervision is the activity of managers who work to ensure the duties are carried out in accordance with a predetermined plan and desired data or results" (Saragih, 2010). According to Siagian (2011), "supervision is the process of observing the implementation of all organizational activities to ensure that all work is carried out in accordance with a predetermined plan". Reksohadiprodjo (2011) argues that "supervision is an effort to give instructions to the implementers to ensure that they always act in accordance with the plan".

The following are some processes or steps that can be used as indicators in the supervision process according to Pandoyo (2007):

- Determining Standard or Standard Measures or Guidelines;
- Assess or Measure the Conducted Works;
- Comparing work implementation the existing standard to find out the occurred deviation;
- Improve or Correct Occurred Deviation, to Ensure Conducted Activities are in Accordance with Predetermined Plan.

*Work Discipline.* Newstrom (in Asmiarsih, 2006) suggests that discipline has 3 forms:

- Preventive Discipline;
- Collective Discipline;
- Progressive Discipline.

Some of the disciplinary principles put forward by Pandoyo (2007) are as follows:

- Discipline is done personally;
- Discipline must be constructive;
- Discipline must be done immediately immediately;
- Justice in discipline is very necessary;
- The leader should not conduct disciplinary action when the employee is absent.

*Closed Circuit Television (CCTV).* Closed Circuit Television or CCTV is a closed line television that can only be accessed by installers. CCTV camera work system is transmitting (sending) data in the form of video and sound images to a monitor or camera recorder. According to the Electronic Information and Transaction Law (ITE) No. 19 of 2016, referred to as Closed Circuit Television (CCTV) is included in the category of electronic information and transactions, namely "a set of electronic data including but not limited to writing, voice, images, maps, design, photos, Electronic Data Interchange (EDI), electronic mail (electronic mail), telegram, telex, telecopy or the like, letters, signs, numbers, access codes, symbols, or processed perforations that have meaning or that can be understood by people who are able to understand it".

*Supervision Effectiveness.* Effectiveness is derived from effective, i.e a job can be said to be effective if a job can produce one unit of output (output). Kusdi (2009) states that "effectiveness is the ability of a company to obtain input, process these inputs, channel output while maintaining stability and balance in a system". Thus, it can be concluded that effectiveness focuses on the outcome (outcome) of a program or activity being assessed. These results can be considered effective if the output (results) produced can meet the expected goals.

In the English dictionary, it is said that effective means working well and producing something as expected. In line with this, the Indonesian dictionary also defines effective as being able to bring results or be effective. Defining and measuring effectiveness, especially within the scope of human resources does not immediately look like other fields that can be measured quantitatively. The effectiveness of supervision must be measured from the extent to which the supervision can reach the stated goals. So that results can be obtained and suggestions for improvements to supervision will be applied.

## METHODS OF RESEARCH

This study used a qualitative research method with a descriptive approach, by focusing the problem on the Implementation of Employee Supervision using CCTV Media. This research was conducted through observation, Miles, Huberman, and Saldana data analysis. It consisted of data collection, data condensation, data presentation, and conclusion drawing.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### **The effectiveness of CCTV Surveillance in Applying Employee Discipline to VOSCO Coffee Malang**

Vosco is very concerned about the quality of each employee it has. Every employee in VOSCO cafe is required to have high discipline. Therefore cafe owners use CCTV as one of the media to monitor the performance of each employee. By using CCTV based supervision, cafe owners may find out the activities carried out by employees during working hours wherever the cafe owner is.

The existence of CCTV is expected to be able to improve employee discipline and provide good performance for all consumers. Discipline problems greatly influence employee work performance. According to Stoner, et al (2000), supervision in management is a systematic effort to set performance standards from various planned goals. Therefore, the disciplinary application to employees will be able to foster employee working satisfaction.

Based on the research result, there is a comparison of the effectiveness of CCTV to employee discipline improvement at Vosco Coffee Malang. Prior to CCTV usage in Vosco Coffee Malang, there were many work violations often carried out by employees of Vosco Coffee Malang. In this case, the café owner did not fully recognize the violations due to lack of CCTV. Whereas after using CCTV as a supervision method, café owner is capable to improve employee work discipline and supervise employees in detail during operating hour without being in the establishment.

Based on the research result, there is a comparison of the effectiveness of CCTV to employee discipline improvement at Vosco Coffee Malang. Prior to CCTV usage in Vosco Coffee Malang, there were many work violations often carried out by employees of Vosco Coffee Malang. In this case, the café owner did not fully recognize the violations due to lack of CCTV. Whereas after using CCTV as a supervision method, café owner is capable to improve employee work discipline and supervise employees in detail during operating hour without being in the establishment. The violations found after the use of CCTV is described as follows:

- Smoking in operating hours. Almost all restaurants impose smoking bans during operating hours. Nevertheless, this ban is the most frequently violated by many restaurant employees, both openly and secretly.
- Using a cell phone during operating hours. Various reasons are often conveyed by employees who are caught using cellphones during operating hours.
- Late arrival to work. Late arrival to work remains one of the disciplinary violations most often carried out by Vosco Coffee employees.
- Change shift without confirmation. Employees are not permitted to change shifts without confirmation. Nevertheless, changing shifts without confirmation is often done by Vosco Coffee employees.
- Standby with an imperfect attitude. Employees who work at the frontline such as Waiter must always maintain a standby attitude with a perfect position, but often there is a waiter who standby with a position that should not, such as bending legs, folding hands on the chest or crossing arms, leaning against the wall, etc.

Based on research result related to the effectiveness of the use of CCTV to improve employee discipline on Vosco Coffee Malang is very effective. It exhibited that the existence of CCTV is very beneficial to the community in terms of security as well as in improving employee discipline. The use of CCTV may aid a cafe owner to supervise employees merely by looking at a monitor screen.

*Problems of CCTV surveillance in improving employee discipline on VOSCO Coffee Malang.* Development continues to evolve accompanied by science and technology advances. Therefore all the needs in the world continue to demand a better change, both in goods and services. A positive impact is also inseparable from the negative impact. Various deviations occur by utilizing increasingly sophisticated information technology to meet all needs. With the many deviant activities that have been carried out by certain parties, the security system must be further enhanced. In a security system, supervision is an important factor

Supervision is a management function conducted to ensure that work is carried out in accordance with the predetermined standards. According to Saragih, (2010) supervision is the management actions to ensure duties are carried out in accordance with a predetermined plan and the desired data or results. Reksomadiprodjo (2011) argues that supervision is an effort to give instructions to executors to ensure they always act according to plan. The main purpose of supervision is an endeavor in realizing a plan.

Several years ago the security system as a form of supervision was carried out in a conventional manner by hiring someone to carry out the supervision. This system was less effective due to shortcomings and weaknesses. Keeping up with the advancement of science and technology makes conventional security systems obsolete and switches to CCTV systems. Closed Circuit Television or CCTV is a closed line television that can only be accessed by installers. CCTV camera work system is transmitting (sending) data in the form of video and sound images to a monitor or camera recorder.

CCTV is considered to be an effective solution for supervision. CCTV has many advantages in security systems. It is capable of record data that can be stored and not affected by time, does not experience fatigue, and can supervise several points at the same time. This system has begun to be used in offices, schools, and housing. Utilizing CCTV, however, does not necessarily solve each existing problem.

VOSCO Coffee Malang conducted surveillance camera system by using CCTV (Closed Circuit Television) connected to the DVR (Digital Video Recorder) as a data store and IP provider connected to the internet on the camera. Therefore, the activities are not only supervised through a monitor screen connected to the room but also through a computer or mobile phone connected to the system through the internet. CCTV cameras are rendered useless during the blackout, however, therefore UPS (Uninterruptible Power Supply) is used as a battery back up to ensure CCTV cameras remain active during blackouts.

Malang VOSCO Coffee experienced issues, such as fire on CCTV systems used and damage incurred. Not to mention CCTV are quite expensive, hence causing a separate issue for VOSCO Coffee Malang. In addition, the cafe lighting level is not adequately bright. Hence, it interferes with image quality displayed. Moreover, CCTV configuration settings are difficult, making it impossible for employees to repair errors. Therefore it requires experts who understand CCTV, hence it incurred additional costs. Furthermore, electrical blackouts often occur, hence disabling the CCTV system.

The various problems experienced by VOSCO Coffee Malang in implementing CCTV systems as a monitoring tool are basically inseparable from the weaknesses of the use of CCTV itself. As for some of the disadvantages of wireless CCTV cameras (Wireless), namely: 1) Setting and configuring is classified as difficult and requires knowledge on LANs. It required a specific expert in configuring wireless CCTV camera. 2) In terms of image quality and object, the movement is still below the average. Higher quality CCTV cameras may project higher quality images compared Analog CCTV cameras. 3) The price is more expensive compared to the cheaper lower quality camera.

## CONCLUSION

Supervision carried out by the VOSCO Coffee cafe was streamlined and effective in monitoring employee performance in every field as it was directly monitored by the owner. CCTV camera directly monitors activities that occur in every part of the café establishment

such as Kitchen Helper, Waitress, Head Kitchen, etc. for 24 hours. This is done to minimize the occurrence of irregularities that are not desired.

The disadvantages of wireless CCTV cameras (Wireless), are difficult setting and configuration. It requires experts with adequate knowledge of LANs capable to configure this wireless CCTV camera, 1) In terms of image quality and object movement is still below the average. Higher quality CCTV cameras may project higher quality images compared Analog CCTV cameras, 2 ) The price is more expensive compared to a cheaper lower quality camera, 3) Setting and configuring is classified as difficult and requires knowledge on LANs. It required a specific expert in configuring wireless CCTV camera.

### **SUGGESTIONS**

Supervision is carried out periodically and continuously to improve the quality of employees and establishment

Conduct disciplinary action to employees performing violations.

The leader conducts direct supervision. Should one owner is absent from the establishment, another owner should be present in the café establishment

Procuring CCTV providing better image quality to ensure clear and effective supervision.

### **REFERENCES**

1. Asmiarsih, T. (2006). Pengaruh Pengawasan Terhadap Disiplin Kerja pegawai. Badan Kepegawaian Daerah Kabupaten Brebes (Unpublished Thesis). Fakultas Ilmu Sosial Universitas Negeri Semarang, Semarang.
2. Budi, S., and Waridin. (2006). Pengaruh Disiplin Kerja Karyawan dan Budaya Organisasi Terhadap Kinerja di Divisi Radiologi RSUP Dokter Kariadi. JRBI, 2(2), 181-198.
3. Cahyadi, B. (2014). Home Security Membuat Webcam sebagai CCTV melalui smartphone android. Bandung: ANDI.
4. Kasali, R. (2008). Membidik Pasar Indonesia Segemenasi Targeting Positioning. Jakarta: PT. Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
5. Kusdi. (2009). Teori Organisasi dan Administrasi. Jakarta: Salemba Humanika.
6. Musanef. (2002). Manajemen Kepegawaian di Indonesia. Jakarta: PT Gunung Agung.
7. Nawawi, H. (2011). Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Untuk Bisnis Yang Kompetitif. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.
8. Pandoyo, H. R. (2007). Prinsip Pendisiplinan. Yogyakarta: FE UGM.
9. Reksohadiprodjo. (2011). Organisasi dan Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia. Yogyakarta: BPFE
10. Saragih. (2010). Manajemen Kinerja. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo.
11. Siagian, S. (2011). Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
12. Stoner, J. A. F., Freeman, R. E., & Gilbert, D. R. (2000). Manajemen. Jakarta: PT Prenhallindo.
13. Surjono, H. (2011). Elektronika: Teori dan Penerapannya. Jakarta: Cerdas Ulet Kreatif Publisher.