



UDC 332

## NAHDLATUL ULAMA OF THE PROBOLINGGO CITY: AMID THE PROCESS OF LOCAL POLICY CHANGES ON NIGHTLIFE VENUES AND EFFORTS TO CLOSE THEM DOWN UNDER THE PUBLIC VALUE PERSPECTIVES

Zauhar Soesilo, Mardiyono, Putra Fadilah, Sucahyo Imam\*

Department of Public Administration, University of Brawijaya, Malang, Indonesia

\*E-mail: [imamsucahyo@upm.ac.id](mailto:imamsucahyo@upm.ac.id)

### ABSTRACT

The public value approach has become a global trend in understanding public administration and policies to balance efficiency and democracy. The main idea lies in the values organizations provide to society through the actions of public managers. Its development extends to collective values outside the public sector, such as private sector values, voluntary sectors, and individual preferences through the public sphere and deliberation. The accumulation leads to actors inside and outside the policy arena, including local policy actors such as the community and religious organizations, like Nahdlatul Ulama of Probolinggo City (PCNU). PCNU is fighting for the values it believes should be accommodated in regional regulations on nightlife venues and efforts to close them down. This paper aims to describe and analyze the role of PCNU in changing regional regulations on nightlife venues and efforts to close them from a public value perspective. The study is qualitative-descriptive with a literature study approach. As a result, the basic value that PCNU fights for is *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar*, which is close to spiritual or religious values. *Amar ma'ruf* here means encouraging people to choose and do the right things; in relation to nightlife venues, especially the ones that do not follow Sharia rules, PCNU encourages people not to visit them. *Nahi munkar* means preventing people from doing bad things; in relation to nightlife venues, PCNU asks the authority to close them down is closing them using the forces held by the government. On the other hand, the government, investors, and visitors focus on visitors' pleasure and business profit (welfare). However, the outcome lies with the Mayor and DPRD, who do not want to close nightlife venues. No significant changes resulted under the previous Mayor's authority. However, the existing Mayor, Habib Hadi, supported by an Islamic party close to NU, did not extend the permits for nightlife venues, and they were closed completely. This means that the struggle for public values is strongly influenced by the values that public managers believe in from the organization that oversees them long before they become public officials.

### KEY WORDS

Public value, public value management, local policy reform, nightlife venues.

The frenetic nightlife, such as discos, pubs, and karaoke, is increasingly inevitable, including in Probolinggo City. At a glance, Probolinggo City Regional Regulation (*Peraturan Daerah - Perda*) Number 9 of 2010 concerning Entertainment Licenses, including "halal" karaoke places operating until late at night, indicates no problem. In reality, such places have caused so many problems, including clandestine prostitution, distribution and consumption of alcoholic liquor, clashes between visitors, hedonism, the outbreak of HIV/AIDS, and the moral decadence of the younger generation. "Ayang" karaoke, for example, has obtained permission from the Probolinggo City Government to operate, yet the business opens up in an educational area and is very close to a school (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 28 March 2013). This permit allegedly violates the Probolinggo City Regional Regulation concerning Regional Spatial Planning (*Rencana Tata Ruang Wilayah - RTRW*). Therefore, Commission A of the Probolinggo City's House of Representatives (*Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah - DPRD*) stated that there were defects in the legal product and the permit for the entertainment venue. As such, it had to be revoked (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 26 March 2013). Another problem emerged when the Probolinggo City Civil Service Police Unit (*Satuan Polisi Pamong Praja - Satpol PP*) caught 9 karaoke hostesses, 2 of



whom were HIV positive (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 1 September 2014). Then, a joint raid by the Probolinggo City Satpol PP and police found six striptease dancers at a nightlife venue. Apart from this performance being considered inappropriate to appear in Probolinggo City, the worst was that out of 10 people who were caught without identification cards, some were high school students (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 3 February 2015). Another raid by Satpol PP caught a karaoke hostess not wearing her pants and underwear while she was accompanying a male guest, also not wearing his pants, inside the karaoke room (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 3 April 2015).

The Probolinggo City Government (*Pemerintah Kota - Pemkot*) considered it as a result of the absence of a Mayor's Regulation (*Peraturan Wali Kota - Perwali*), which technically regulates the Regional Regulation Number 9/2010 (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 11 February 2015). However, Probolinggo City DPRD took steps to amend the Regional Regulation through a draft concerning the arrangement and control of entertainment places as a regional legislation program and defined it as an urgent policy (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 6 December 2014). Theoretically, the draft would be the first step to creating public value through policies. Scott and Baehler (2010) reveal that policy is about creating public value and emphasizes the relationship between the policy triangle and the strategic management triangle, which requires a network of connections between policy and management functions to ensure government activities run effectively, efficiently and in line with society's fundamental values.

For this reason, defining public value involves many parties, including monitoring it from the initial stage (issues and agenda) to decision-making within the framework of policy formulation through a transparent and deliberative mechanism, which is the best way to realize public value. Bromell (2012) reveals that a public values approach to policymaking is characterized by respectful relationships, critical thinking, creative conversation, and strategic collaboration. Such circumstances require a different set of attitudes, skills and behaviors of cooperation and compliance in policymaking. The client is the public, the success is better results (added value for the public), and the characteristic mode of operation is co-creation. Meanwhile, Jørgensen and Bozeman (2007) reveal that nowadays, there is nothing more important in public administration and policy than public values.

The concept of public value actually departs from Moore's thinking, which is singular in nature and targets individual managers, especially at the top level of the hierarchy of a single public organization (Bryson et al., 2016). This concept was later developed into plural (public values) by Bozeman (2007), which focuses on policies or social levels based on normative consensus (Bozeman, 2007 in Bryson, Crosby and Bloomberg, 2014). On the other hand, Stoker (2006) describes public value as not simply the sum of individual preferences as users or providers of public services but rather as collectively built through deliberation involving elected or appointed government officials and other key stakeholders.

Therefore, it is not surprising that the preferences of these individuals then not only accumulate among actors who have authority in formulating local public policies, such as DPRD and the Mayor, but also among the community, mass organizations, and even religious organizations, such as the Probolinggo City Nahdlatul Ulama (PCNU). Even though PCNU does not have direct authority in making local policies, it has proven capable of bringing about the change of Probolinggo City Regional Regulation Number 9 of 2010 to Probolinggo City Regional Regulation Number 9 of 2015. Policy stakeholders are individuals or groups who can influence or be influenced by the achievement of organizational goals and play a role in certain issues or problems in the policy-making stage, where they can be inside and outside the government (Hardee et al., 2004).

Everything PCNU fights for cannot be separated from the values the organization believes in. In this context, the values are on the demand for the elimination of all nightclubs. If this is not possible, at least there must be a distance of one kilometer from places of worship and educational institutions. Especially for karaoke venues, there must be the inclusion of articles that clearly differentiate between adult karaoke and family karaoke, doors made of clear glass, centralized karaoke room lights that visitors cannot turn off, management ensures that workers and visitors dress neatly and politely according to local wisdom, and no bathroom facilities in each karaoke room. PCNU fought for everything in



regional regulations, as well as through the implementation of regional regulations, which were driven by PCNU cadres who served as public officials.

Thus, the research aimed to examine the efforts of PCNU to fight for the values they believed should be included in the regional regulation of nightlife venues in Probolinggo City and efforts to close down those venues that violate local and religious values.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

Stoker (2006) assessed that old public administration paradigms, such as Traditional Public Administration (TPA) and New Public Management (NPM), have several shortcomings. Therefore, they have been replaced by new approaches such as New Public Service (Janet and Denhardt, 2011), New Civic Politics (Boyte et al., 2011), New Public Governance (Osborne, 2010), Managing Publicness (Bozeman, 2007), Public Value Management (Stoker, 2006), and others. Meanwhile, Public Value Management (PVM), which in other terms is also called Public Value Theory (Connolly and Zwet, 2021), tries to balance efficiency and democracy as a derivative of Moore's public value framework (Osmani, 2014). This thinking then became a new global trend in understanding public administration, policy-making and public services since the 1990s (Bracci et al., 2014; O'Flynn, 2007; Rutgers, 2015; Stoker, 2006).

In fact, all approaches boil down to the struggle for values that are believed in and want to be achieved. In the Merriam-Webster dictionary, value is defined as 1) relative worth, utility, or importance of something; 2) something (such as a principle or quality) intrinsically valuable or desirable (<https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/values>). Meanwhile, Scheler (in Bertens, 1983) identified the value of being: a) pleasure values (and vice versa), b) vital values, c) spiritual values such as aesthetic values (beautiful and ugly), truth (right and wrong), pure or selfless knowledge, and d) religious values such as sacred and impure. Meanwhile, the word public is interpreted by individuals and groups of individuals (Firth, 1998). However, when these two words are combined into public values, we come to the idea of Moore (1995), namely the values that organizations provide to society, where public managers take action to create public values that can influence democratic principles such as accountability and legitimacy (in Yun, 2018). Moore argues that public managers have a key role in creating public value through the strategic triangle conception, both upward, outward and downward. Moore's public value concept targets individual managers, especially at the top level of the hierarchy of a single public organization (Bryson et al., 2016).

Furthermore, the idea of public values was developed into a plural (public values) by Bozeman (2007 in Bryson, Crosby and Bloomberg, 2014). Even Osmani (2014) emphasized that public value is not simply created by the public sector alone but can come from the private, voluntary and community sectors. Furthermore, Bennington (2011) reformulated the public value approach through a framework that starts from collective values as the main unit of analysis, meaning not just the private sector and individuals but through public spaces, namely democratic spaces, which include a network of values, places, organizations, rules, knowledge and other cultural resources held together by society through daily commitments and behavior mandated by governments and public institutions (in Bryson, Crosby and Bloomberg, 2014). The conception of public space, according to Dryzek (2000), is not merely interpreted physically but is a social space produced by communicative action as a place for the formation of public opinion, which reflects issues developing at the elite and mass levels. Therefore, Bozeman and Johnson (2015) define a public space where communication is carried out openly and deliberation about public values, and collective action leads to public values (in Jørgensen and Rutgers, 2015).

Specifically, if this value is linked to the discourse of public policy analysis, then according to Hodgkinson (1978), as quoted by Abdul Wahab (in Achmady et al., 1994), it will intersect with metapolicy aspects related to substance, perspective and attitude, i.e., attitudes and behavior of the actors responsible for formulating public policy, whether hidden or openly stated. The focus is on philosophical and political issues while also prioritizing issues of values, which in many countries revolve around concerns regarding the values of



justice, liberty and welfare. Another meaning is that the more actors involved, the more complex the public values being fought for. This is what is described as the Public Value Governance Triangle (Bryson et al., 2015), namely a strategic triangle framework in a more complex environment (multi-actor, multi-organization, and multi-sector). However, that is where the essence of meeting public values is, namely, the competition between the values and interests of various groups, including minorities, either through debate or the process of deliberative democracy (Bennington, 2011 in Bromell, 2012). In a decision/policy-making process, the most basic thing about deliberative democracy is open debate and dialogue (Pierre & Peters, 2000).

To support this literature review, it is also a good idea for the author to present several previous studies, both of which use a public value approach. First, Bromell (2012), whose essence is that the central construction in efforts to create public value through a strategic triangle can be understood and achieved together through public space, namely a network of values, places, organizations, rules, knowledge and other cultural resources that are held together through daily commitments and behavior and are trusted by the government. Public values in any particular case can only be established through a process of deliberation in which competing values and interests are expressed and debated. The meaning of the public value approach for the role of policy advice is: 1) pushing it to a certain limit, 2) making government ideas applicable, and 3) keeping things implemented. Meanwhile, Bryson et al. (2014) broadly state that a new approach with values beyond efficiency and effectiveness, namely democratic values, leads to the creation of public value played by the government together with society, the business sector and organizations non-profit through collaboration, democracy, content and governance. Public values emerge from broad inclusive dialogue and deliberation in various sectors, not just the exclusive domain of the government and the government is not the only institution that can determine public values. The public manager's role is to create and guide deliberative networks and deliver, maintain, and improve the effectiveness, capacity, and accountability of the system as a whole. Public values are built from values characterized by the relationship between individuals and society, which leads to the achievement of normative consensus regarding the basic needs of individuals, groups and society as a whole, which influence each other. Meanwhile, public space is a "democratic space", including a network of values, places, organizations, rules, knowledge, and other cultural resources held together through daily commitments and behavior, and also held by the government. Public values make it possible to unite debates about values, institutions, systems, processes, and society through insights from a variety of analytical perspectives, including public policy, policy analysis, management, economics, and political science.

Todoruț & Tselentis (2015) consider that the concept of public value is proposed as a model that promotes networked governance as a multi-dimensional, collective structure not only based on results but also on processes that can generate trust and equity. Public managers can create public value in directing the public policy development process in partnership with other actors and stakeholders through the strategic triangle concept; 1) defining public values; 2) creating an authority environment, building and maintaining coalitions with stakeholders; and 3) building operational capacity by mobilizing operational resources (human, managerial, financial, competency, technology) needed to fulfill the desired public value. Collaboration may prioritize efficiency at the expense of public values over private interests. In practice, public values can improve performance through democratic values and achieving managerial goals.

## METHODS OF RESEARCH

This study employed a qualitative-descriptive method using a literature study approach. Library research is an investigation that aims to collect data and information in the library (Pasolong, 2013), such as from books, newspapers, magazines, documents, and so on, including those obtained through online searches. Therefore, several kinds of literature regarding the concept of public value and its development, along with data related to the process of changing Probolinggo City regional regulations governing nightlife venues, will be



explored carefully in this research. The City of Probolinggo was chosen because, factually, this casuistry occurred in the City of Probolinggo. Apart from that, this small town is a city of investment and services (Kabar Probolinggo, 6 February 2015), in addition to efforts to avoid the stigma of being a city that is not investment-friendly and is considered to violate the rights of every citizen to open a business (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 12 February 2015). On the other hand, the majority of religious adherents in this city are Muslims, reaching 96.86% ([https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kota\\_Probolinggo](https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kota_Probolinggo)), as well as NU adherents, who do not want the morals of the community to be degraded and consider that the social impact of nightlife is rather detrimental (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 26 November 2014).

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Public values should not only be seen as values that organizations provide to society through public managers but can also come from private, voluntary, community, and religious organizations. In this context, the public values referred to have been reflected in Probolinggo City Regional Regulation Number 9 of 2010. However, as problems emerge, such as residents' protests against the establishment of entertainment venues on Jalan Mastrip, which has been designated as an educational area (Article 59 Paragraph 5 Letter d Probolinggo City Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2010 concerning Regional Spatial Planning). There is a statement from Commission A of the Probolinggo City DPRD that permits for entertainment venues must be revoked because there are defects in legal products related to RTRW (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 26 March 2013). There is also misuse of karaoke venue permits as a place for erotic dancing and distributing alcoholic liquor (Radar Bromo, 2 February 2015). There are also fights between visitors, the half-naked visitors and karaoke hostesses in the karaoke booth, and visitors carrying weapons (<https://news.detik.com/berita-jawa-timur/d-2911162/polisi-probolinggo-razia-rumah-karaoke-empat-pemandu-lagu-diamankan>), etc. Seeing all the phenomena above, PCNU then took a stand and started a fight to maintain the local and religious values of Probolinggo by encouraging people to do good deeds and preventing all immoral actions that can lower the values of life (Ghazali, 1997).

The role of PCNU cannot be underestimated. As the largest Islamic organization in Indonesia, even in the world, its members have reached 95 million as of 2021 ([https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Nahdlatul\\_Ulama](https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Nahdlatul_Ulama)). Practically, it has become a political force as well as a government stakeholder, which bridges, articulates, and aggregates interests through its cadres in policy arenas, both executive and legislative. Some of them are K.H. Ma'ruf Amin (Vice President of the Republic of Indonesia), Khofifah Indar Parawansa (Governor of East Java Province), Habib Hadi Zainal Abidin (Mayor of Probolinggo), and a multitude of central and regional council members. NU, together with other social/religious organizations, succeeded in pressuring President Jokowi to revoke the attachment to the Presidential Regulation regarding new investment in the alcoholic liquor industry (<https://www.bbc.com/indonesia/indonesia-56231008>) because alcoholic drinks offer more harm than benefits.

PCNU also hopes that they can do the same thing in Probolinggo, changing the policy that can harm the public. Entertainment venues, especially nightlife ones, can have a great impact on society, and the impact seems more negative than positive. This is the arena where PCNU fights a fight to maintain the local and religious values of Probolinggo by encouraging people to do good deeds and preventing all immoral actions that can lower the values of life. PCNU fights inside and outside the policy arena. Outside the policy arena, PCNU collaborates with other organizations such as Muhammadiyah, Al-Irsyad, Islamic Community Organization Communication Forum, Private Madrasah Aliyah Coordination Network (Jakmas), Probolinggo City MUI and students who are members of the Probolinggo Indonesian Islamic Student Movement (*Pergerakan Mahasiswa Islam Indonesia* Probolinggo - PMII). According to Brinkerhoff & Crosby (2002), they are a society that is organized in terms of its steps, strategies, and actual actions, and what is more fundamental is the existence of a formal organizational framework that surrounds it.



For nightlife venues, the goal is very clear: closing all nightlife venues in Probolinggo City. The real action is reflected in the PCNU's position statement in Letter Number 018/PC/A.II/L-38/III/2013 addressed to the Mayor of Probolinggo. The letter demands that the government research and review permits for night entertainment venues and pay attention to environmental impact analysis and RTRW in every policy to uphold morals, ethics, values and norms as well as the public benefit. Letter Number 123/PC/A.II/L-38/IX/2014 urges the government to close the "Ayang" karaoke nightclub. PCNU also strongly recommends that the government of Probolinggo City follow up every article that appears in print media, both local and national, such as the article from Miftah (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 18 January 2015; see also Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 5 April 2015). Another article from Mawardati (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 5 April 2015). According to Bennington (2011), this is an effort to ground public values better so that they can be properly understood and achieved in the idea of public spaces.

The public value approach, especially PVM, emphasizes values beyond efficiency and effectiveness, namely democratic values, which place public managers as guarantors of public values, in addition to society and the business sector and non-profit organizations, which are also important as active public problem solvers (Bryson et al., 2014). PCNU sees that the root of this problem is in the nightclub itself. As part of their active problem-solving, they will then state their position: not issuing new nightlife venue permits, taking firm action against violators, directing new investors to businesses other than nightlife through letters of recommendation to the Mayor and Probolinggo City DPRD on the results of the PCNU Conference. The results of intense coordination with NU East Java produced a Letter Number 794/PW/A-1/L/IV/2015, which pressures the Probolinggo City Government to revoke night entertainment permits that are proven to violate and recommends the closure of night entertainment venues and clearly accuses "JJ Royal" and "Ayang" Karaoke as sources of moral decline and moral crimes (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 5 May 2015). Another effort by PMII was to street demonstration (<https://liputan6-com-tag-probolinggo.blogspot.com/2016/02/stop-penerbitan-izin-plac-hiburan-baru.html?m=1>). Just to note, the establishment of PMII was driven by NU youth cadres ([https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Permobilan\\_Mahasiswa\\_Islam\\_Indonesia](https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Permobilan_Mahasiswa_Islam_Indonesia)). According to Putra (2003), demonstrations are a very open way to absorb aspirations and fight for them at a higher stage.

In the policy arena, PKB and PPP, as political parties, have the authority to carry out policy changes as one of the implementations of legislative functions, so PCNU approaches the two parties as they have representation in the regional legislative. It has been known for a long time that NU is very close to the two Islamic political parties (<https://www.kompas.id/baca/polhuk/2022/03/29/memori-38-tahun-lampau-bersama-ppp-dan-dynamics-nu-towards-khittah>). As a result, the Probolinggo City DPRD, through Commission A, began holding hearings with parties, such as the Indonesian Ulema Council (*Majelis Ulama Indonesia* – MUI), the Investment and Licensing Services Agency, the Ministry of Religion, the Education Service, the Probolinggo City Bappeda (Regional Development Planning Agency), the Education Council, and other community figures, and PCNU itself. At one point, the Probolinggo City DPRD even issued a recommendation letter Number 170/280/425,050/2015 to the City Mayor to revoke the permit for a nightclub. Commission A has also recommended the closure of all nightlife venues in Probolinggo City, giving a strong warning to the Mayor of Probolinggo over the inconsistency of his stance. This means that the DPRD has truly carried out its supervisory function as a representative of the community over the implementation of regional regulations; in this function, the DPRD also plays its role as a public services watch (Usaid, 2007).

Along the way, PCNU's struggle finally received a response from the Legislative Body (*Badan Legislatasi* - Banleg) of the Probolinggo City DPRD by proposing a draft of regional regulation regulating entertainment venues. The academic text was prepared jointly with the Universitas Brawijaya's Community Service and Development Institute (*Lembaga Pengabdian dan Pengembangan Masyarakat* - LPPM), where the finalization of the draft accommodates several values, including the distinction between family karaoke and adult karaoke, employers are obliged to ensure that workers and visitors dress politely according



to local wisdom, all karaoke venues shall be located at a minimum distance of 1 kilometer from educational institutions and places of worship, regulations regarding opening hours, and so on (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 8 September 2015). However, Banleg's dissatisfaction with the LPPM's performance in drafting also emerged, including regarding the validity of the academic texts because they did not contain information from which institution, no academic stamp, and a list of references that did not refer to entertainment, let alone night entertainment (Java Pos-Radar Bromo, 20 August 2015).

In short, the proposed Regional Regulation regulating entertainment venues by the DPRD received a positive response from the Probolinggo City Government, which then gave birth to Probolinggo City Regional Regulation Number 9 of 2015 through the determination of the Mayor of Probolinggo, Hj. Rukmini as of 30 December 2015. The core details of the public values stated include: Article 7 (v) on maintaining and respecting religious norms, politeness, customs, culture and noble values that live in the local community, (w) open room design that does not lead to immoral acts in which the room's interior can be seen from the outside and it has centralized room lighting; Article 9 (1) on closing karaoke businesses and pubs/music houses during Ramadan, the eve of Eid al-Fitr, the eve of Eid al-Adha and other Islamic holidays; Article 10 (k) on not providing karaoke hostesses, (l) no toilets in karaoke rooms; Article 11 on prohibition from holding live music every Thursday from 16.00 to 24.00 WIB; Article 12 (1) on the location of karaoke and pubs/music houses that must not be less than 300 meters from places of worship and places of education; Article 15 (3) on the formation of supervision teams for entertainment business organizers from several government elements; and Article 16 on prohibition of certain types of entertainment venues, namely discos, nightclubs, and massage parlours.

The values contained in the few articles above do not fully reflect the values fought for by the PCNU, which it believes are the values of the general public. For example, PCNU wants the closure of all nightclubs or at least set the distance of nightclubs to one kilometer from places of worship or educational institutions. In plain view, this value reflects public value as the revocation of the attachment to the Presidential Regulation regarding the new policy on investment in the liquor industry, which contains more detrimental value than beneficial value. If this is related to Scheler's view (in Bertens, 1983), it certainly refers to spiritual values, which relate to truth, or religious values relating to holiness, and so on. But in reality, local governments, investors, and visitors have other values which they believe are public values, including that the investment climate must continue to grow conducive. Closing nightlife venues will then have far-reaching impacts, such as cancellation of investment and dismissal of employees (Jawa et al., 12 February 2015), which automatically increases the unemployment rate (Harian Bangsa, 18 November 2015). Not to mention the tax sector income to the region from the operation of 5 nightlife entertainment venues which contributed at least 168 million as of 31 October 2014 (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 21 November 2014). In 2014, it reached 295 million, and in 2013, it reached 209 million (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 13 February 2015), and even in 2016, it reached 434 million, exceeding the target of 375 million (Jawa Pos, 8 February 2017). All the reviews above, if linked back to Scheler's views (in Bertens, 1983), could lead to pleasure values, vital values, and even welfare values (Achmady et al., 1994).

Therefore, after the issuance of the Probolinggo City Regional Regulation 9/2015 under the leadership of Mrs. Hj. Rukmini, nightlife venues in Probolinggo City were still operating as usual; there was no permanent closing and the distance between those venues that was demanded to be 1 kilometer from places of worship and educational institutions was realized at only 300 meters, not bringing much significant change. The only real action was a warning from the Mayor through the Probolinggo City Investment and Licensing Services Agency (*Badan Penanaman Modal dan Pelayanan Perizinan - BPMPP*) against the "Pop City" karaoke manager because of the presence of underage visitors (Koran Pantura, 29 April 2016). Another action was not to issue new permits for karaoke places (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 2 February 2016). However, many violations still occurred. Based on a sudden inspection by Commission A of the Probolinggo City DPRD, it was found that 60% of night entertainment venues in Probolinggo City violated the Regional Regulation (Koran Pantura, 26 January 2017). Even though the Mayor closed the "Pop City" karaoke on the



recommendation of the Probolinggo City DPRD, it was reopened one month later (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 18 March 2017).

However, after the biggest karaoke venue, “Bee Jay Karaoke”, experienced a fire and was completely damaged, many residents objected to it being rebuilt (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 22 November 2017). The public’s expression shows support for the effort to close nightlife venues, which was also in line with the results of hearings initiated and carried out by Commission A of the Probolinggo City DPRD. However, in reality, what happened was different. There seems to be a kind of distortion of meaning in the process of formulating regional regulations on public values. If this is true, the public interest in the public value approach, which should be produced through a complex interaction process involving deliberative reflection (Kelly & Muers, 2002), has not yet been fully implemented.

As the leadership changed from Hj. Rukmini to Habib Hadi Zainal Abidin as Mayor of Probolinggo, the business permits for some remaining karaoke places will no longer be extended (Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo, 7 August 2019). This means two different meanings under the same regulation, namely the Probolinggo City Regional Regulation 9/2015, in which different public managers produce different results. Under the leadership of Hj. Rukmini, nightlife venues operated as usual. However, under the leadership of Habib Hadi Zainal Abidin, it was proven that the closure of all nightclubs could be realized. Last year, “Karaoke 888”, disguised as a facility from the Tampiarito Hotel, unilaterally started operating, and the permit was still being submitted to the government, but Mayor Habib Hadi Zainal Abidin closed it (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3a90Yfj0ZH4>). This is the true picture of a PVM manager who is able to play his role in controlling the deliberative network as well as delivering and maintaining the overall capacity of a system (Kelly & Muers, 2002). The support from several community organizations also proves that the closing of those nightlife venues is what the public wants (Java Pos-Radar Bromo, 20 August 2019).

Habib Hadi Zainal Abidin is the Chairman of the Branch Leadership Council of the Partai Kebangkitan Bangsa, a political party (<https://kompaspedia.kompas.id/>) and has also served as Deputy Syuriah Rois PCNU Probolinggo City. PKB and NU, including other Islamic parties, such as PPP from local to central levels, are close. This also proves that the realization of public values, however, is very dependent on public managers who have authority in policy-making. Authority is also needed in implementation, in addition to other authorities that arise because of their position as public managers in the executive.

## CONCLUSION

We emphasize that the public values approach that accommodates public values today is not only born from public sector managers but from other sectors, including society, community organizations, and religious organizations, such as PCNU. Because its nature was born and championed by religious organizations, it is clear that the values promoted are *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar*, namely encouraging good deeds and preventing all bad things from degrading the values of life. This represents spiritual values and/or religious values. However, in an effort to make this happen, it is not enough just to change local public policies, namely regional regulations. Public managers with firm and legal authority are also needed in the implementation.

## REFERENCES

1. 6 Penari Erotis Diamankan. (2015, Februari 2). Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo. h. 25.
2. Achmady, et al. (1994). Kebijakan Publik & Pembangunan. Malang: Fakultas Ilmu Administrasi Universitas Brawijaya dan IKIP Malang.
3. Audiensi Atau Buka Kembali, Pop City dan 888 Wadul ke DPRD. (2019, Agustus 7). Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo. h. 17.
4. Brinkerhoff, D. W., & Benjamin, L. C. (2002). Managing Policy Reform; Concept and Tools for Decision-Makers in Developing and Transitioning Country. USA Bloomfield: Kumarian Press.
5. Bertens, K. (1983). Filsafat Barat dalam Abad XX, Inggris-Jerman. PT. Gramedia.





6. Benington, J. (2009). Creating the Public in Order to Create Public Value? *International Journal of Public Administration*, 32(3-4).
7. Bromell, D. (2012). Creating Public Value in the Policy Advice Role: A Reflection from the Front Line. *Policy Quarterly*, 8(4), 16-22.
8. Bryson, J. M., Barbara, C. C., & Laura, B. (2014). Public Value Governance: Moving Beyond Traditional Public Administration and the New Public Management. *Public Administration Review*, 74(4), 445-456.
9. Bryson, J. M., Alessandro, S., John, B., & Eva, S. (2016). Towards a multi-actor theory of public value co-creation. *Public Management*, 19(5), 640-654.
10. Bulan ini, Dewan Urus Raperda Hiburan Malam. (2015, April 5). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*.
11. Cari Pijakan Raperda Tempat Hiburan Malam, Banleg Bakal Jaring Masukan Masyarakat. (2014, Desember 6). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*. h. 31.
12. Connolly, J., & Zwet, A. V. D. (2021). *Public Value Management, Governance and Reform in Britain*. USA: Springer.
13. Desak Evaluasi Tempat Karaoke. (2014, September 1). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*. h. 25.
14. Dewan Siapkan Rekomendasi, Sidak Temukan Banyak Pelanggaran. (2017, Januari 26). *Koran Pantura*. h. 35.
15. Dewan Rekomendasikan Tutup Hiburan Malam. (2014, Nov.). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*.
16. DPRD Kecewa Sikap Pemkot. (2015, Februari, 6). *Kabar Probolinggo*. h. 1.
17. Draf Raperda Hiburan Malam Tak Memuaskan. (2015, Agustus 20).
18. Dryzek, J. (2000). *Deliberative Democracy and Beyond: Liberals, Critics, Contestations*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
19. Firth, L. J. (1998). Role of values in public decision-making: where is the fit? *Impact Assessment and Project Appraisal*, 327.
20. Ghazali, Al. (1997). *Mutiara Ihya' Ulumudin, Ringkasan yang ditulis sendiri oleh sang Hujjatul-Islam*. Bandung: Mizan Pustaka.
21. Hardee, K., Imelda, F., Jill, B., & Benjamin, C. (2004). *The Policy Circle: A Framework for Analyzing the Components of Family Planning, Reproductive Health, Maternal Health, and HIV/AIDS Policies*. Policy Working Paper Series No. 11 June 2004,9.
22. Hiburan Malam Sumbang PAD Rp 168 Juta. (2014, Nov.). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*.
23. [https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kota\\_Probolinggo](https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kota_Probolinggo)
24. [https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Nahdlatul\\_Ulama](https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Nahdlatul_Ulama)
25. [https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pergerakan\\_Mahasiswa\\_Islam\\_Indonesia](https://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pergerakan_Mahasiswa_Islam_Indonesia)
26. <https://kompaspedia.kompas.id/baca/profil/tokoh/wali-kota-probolinggo-hadi-zainal-abidin>
27. <https://liputan6-com-tag-probolinggo.blogspot.com/2016/02/stop-penerbitan-izin-tempat-hiburan-baru.html?m=1>
28. <https://news.detik.com/berita-jawa-timur/d-2911162/polisi-probolinggo-razia-rumah-karaoke-empat-pemandu-lagu-diamankan>
29. <https://www.bbc.com/indonesia/indonesia-56231008>
30. <https://www.kompas.id/baca/polhuk/2022/03/29/memori-38-tahun-lampau-bersama-ppp-dan-dinamika-nu-menuju-khittah>
31. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/values/>
32. <https://www.suaramerdeka.com/nasional/pr-045467927/profil-habib-hadi-wali-kota-probolinggo-yang-keras-menutup-tempat-karaoke-lengkap-pendidikan-dan-akun-ig-nya?page=2>
33. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3a90Yfj0ZH4>
34. Juga Sempat Jaring Pelajar. (2015, Februari 3). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*. h. 25.
35. Jørgensen, T. B., & Mark, R. R. (2015). Public Values: Core or Confusion? Introduction to the Centrality and Puzzlement of Public Values Research. *American Review of Public Administration*, 45(1).
36. Jørgensen, T. B. et al (2007). Public Values an Inventory. *Administration & Society*, 305.
37. Kelly, K., Mulgan, G., & Muers, S. (2002). *Creating Public Value. An Analytical Framework for Public Service Reform*. London: Cabinet Office.
38. Komisi A: Pemkot Langgar Perda. (2013, Maret 26). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*. h. 25.
39. Moore, M. (1995). *Creating public value: Strategic management in government*. Boston: Harvard University Press.



40. O'Flynn, J. (2007). From New Public Management to Public Value: Paradigmatic Change and Managerial Implications. *The Australian Journal of Public Administration*, 66(3).
41. Ormas Keagamaan Minta Pemkot Tegas. (2015, Februari 13). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*.
42. Osmani, M. W. (2014). *Examining the Antecedents of Public Value in E-Government Services (Unpublished Dissertation)*. Brunel University, London.
43. Pasolong, H. (2013). *Metode Penelitian Administrasi Publik*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
44. PCNU Kutuk Tempat Hiburan. (2015, Februari 2). *Kabar Probolinggo*. h. 1.
45. Pemkot Akui Teledor. (2015, Februari 12). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*. h. 25.
46. Pemkot Kekeh Tak Perpanjang Izin. (2019, Agustus 20). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*. h. 17.
47. Pengelola Janji Akan Berbenah, Siap Penuhi Rekomendasi Komisi A Soal Hiburan Malam. (2017, Februari 8). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*. h. 21.
48. Peraturan Daerah Kota Probolinggo Nomor 2 Tahun 2010 tentang Rencana Tata Ruang Wilayah (RTRW).
49. Nomor 9 Tahun 2010 tentang Ijin Hiburan.
50. Nomor 9 Tahun 2015 tentang Penataan, Pengawasan, dan Pengendalian Usaha Tempat Hiburan.
51. Pergoki Pural Tak Bercelana. (2015, April 3). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*. h. 25.
52. Perizinan Kawal Perwali Perda Tempat Hiburan. (2015, Februari 11). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*.
53. Perizinan Tegur Pop City, Ada Pengunjung di Bawah Umur. (2016, April 29). *Koran Pantura*. h. 1.
54. Pierre, J. and B. G. Peters. (2000). *Governance, Politics and The State*. New York: St. Martin's Press.
55. Pop City Kembali Beroperasi. (2017, Maret 18). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*.
56. Portillo, S. (2019). *New Public Service: Gray Matters in The Delivery of Public Added Value Through Creative Governance Practices – A Silver Lining to Managing the Effects of A Changing Demographic*. Dissertation of the University of Texas at Arlington. Published by ProQuest Number: 27629406.
57. Putra, F. (2003). *Paradigma Kritis dalam Studi Kebijakan Publik: Perubahan dan Inovasi Kebijakan Publik dan Ruang Partisipasi Masyarakat dalam Proses Kebijakan Publik*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
58. PWNU Desak Cabut Izin Hiburan Malam. (2015, Mei 5). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*.
59. Raperda Hiburan Malam Final. (2015, September 8). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*.
60. Sidak Ayang Café, Pergoki Ketua MUI. (2013, Maret 28). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*. h. 29.
61. Scott, C. D. and K. J. Baehler. (2010). *Adding Value to Policy Analysis and Advice*. University of New South Wales Press.
62. Stoker, G. (2006). Public Value Management: a New Narrative for Networked Governance? *The American Review of Public Administration*, 36-41.
63. Stop Penerbitan Izin Tempat Hiburan Baru. (2016, Feb.). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*. h. 25.
64. Surat DPRD Kota Probolinggo Nomor: 170/280/425,050/2015, perihal Rekomendasi Komisi A.
65. Surat PCNU Kota Probolinggo: 018/PC/A.II/L-38/III/2013, perihal Pernyataan Sikap.
66. 123/PC/A.II/L-38/IX/2014, perihal Tempat Hiburan Malam dan Cafe.
67. Surat PWNU Jawa Timur: 794/PW/A-1/L/IV/2015, perihal Kejahatan Moral di Kota Probolinggo.
68. Todoruț, A. V., & Vassilis, T. (2015). Designing the Model of Public Value Management. *Proceedings of the 9th International Management Conference "Management and Innovation for Competitive Advantage"*, November 5th-6th, 2015, Bucharest, Romania.
69. Tolak Bangun Ulang. (2017, Nopember 22). *Jawa Pos-Radar Bromo*.
70. USAID. (2007). *Membina Hubungan dengan Konstituen*. Jakarta: LGSP.
71. Walikota Rukmini Terima Kunjungan PCNU. (2015, Nopember 18). *Harian Bangsa*.
72. Yun, J. A. (2018). *Creating Public Values through Cross-Sector Collaboration: A Case of Business Improvement Districts in New Jersey*. (Dissertation, the Graduate School-Newark Rutgers, the State University of New Jersey). Published by ProQuest: 13819029.